# Products of generalized equivalent operators in angular momentum theory ${ }^{1}$ 

SERGE Luryi<br>Departhent of Physics, University of Toronto, Toromto, Ont., Canada M5S IA7<br>Received September 22, 1978


#### Abstract

Genemalized operator equivalents to the (bipolar) spherical harmonics $T_{\left.l m^{\left(l_{1}\right.}{ }^{\prime}\right)}^{\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}\right)}$ are considered, viz. $P_{F_{1}} P_{F_{2}} T_{l_{m} / 2}^{\left(l^{\prime}\right)}\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}\right) P_{J_{1}} P_{J_{2}}$, where the $P_{J}$ are projection operators on the manifolds of definite angular momenta. A closed formula is derived for the coefficients of the Clebsch-Gordan decomposition of products of such operators.


#### Abstract

On considère des opérateurs généralisés équivalents aux harmoniques sphériques (bipolaires) $T_{l m}^{\left(l_{1}\right)}\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}\right)$ à savoir $P_{r_{1}} P_{r_{2}} T_{l m}^{(t, 1)}\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}\right) P_{J_{1}} P_{l_{2}}$, où les $P_{J}$ sont des opérateurs de projection sur les ensembles de moments cinétiques à valeurs définies. On établit une expression finie pour les coefficients de la décomposition Clebsch-Gordan des produits d"opérateurs de ce type.


[Traduit par le journal]

## 1. Introduction

In various physical problems one meets irreducible tensor operators formed by restricting spherical harmonics to a finite portion of the Hilbert space, viz.
[1] $\quad \hat{C}_{l m}(F, J)=P_{F} C_{l m}(\boldsymbol{\omega}) P_{J} /\langle F|\left|C_{l} \| J\right\rangle$
where $C_{t m}(\omega)$ is a spherical harmonic in the notation of Brink and Satchler (1), and $P_{F}$ is the projection operator on the manifold of states of angular momentum $\boldsymbol{J}^{2}=F(F+1)$, i.e.,

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{F}=\sum_{M=-F}^{F}|F M\rangle\langle F M| \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

When $F=J$, one usually replaces the operators

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{C}_{l m}(J) \equiv \hat{C}_{l m}(J, J) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

by explicit expressions constructed out of the components of the vector operator $J$. These explicit expressions, first introduced by Stevens (2), are called the equivalent operators, and their equivalence to $[3]$ is valid only within the manifold $J$.
In certain problems one encounters products of equivalent operators $\hat{C}_{1 m}(J)$ or the generalized equivalent operators $\hat{C}_{l m}(F, J)$. These problems arise, for example, in studying rotational correlation functions for particles confined to a given manifold (3). To calculate matrix elements of a product of equivalent operators it is convenient to expand the latter in a Clebsch-Gordan series, e.g.,
[4]

$$
\begin{aligned}
\hat{C}_{l_{1} m_{1}}(F, J) \hat{C}_{l 2 m_{2}}(J, F)
\end{aligned} \quad \begin{aligned}
& \quad=\sum_{l m} \alpha_{l m} C\left(l_{1} l_{2} l ; m_{1} m_{2} m\right) \hat{C}_{l m}(F)
\end{aligned}
$$

where the coefficients $\alpha_{l m}$ depend on $F$ and $J$. One of

[^0]the purposes of this work is to give a closed expression for these coefficients. It should be noted that, in general, the class of operators $\hat{C}_{l m}(F)$ which appears in the right-hand side of [4] is wider than that defined by [1] and [3], since spherical harmonics do not form a complete set of operators in $F$. In ref. 3, the coefficients $\alpha_{l m}$ were tabulated for the case $J=F=1$ which is relevant for ortho-hydrogen molecules at low temperature.

Another example of equivalent-operator products occurs in perturbation calculations (4). In problems involving two orientations one often uses the socalled bipolar harmonics (I), which are the irreducible tensors formed by coupling two spherical harmonics with different arguments,
[5] $\quad T_{l m}^{\left(1, l_{2}\right)}\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}\right)$

$$
=\sum_{m_{1} m_{2}} C\left(l_{1} l_{2} / ; m_{1} m_{2} m\right) C_{l_{1}, m_{1}}\left(\boldsymbol{\omega}_{1}\right) C_{l_{2} m_{2}}\left(\boldsymbol{\omega}_{2}\right)
$$

These tensors can be used to expand an arbitrary anisotropic potential $V\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}, q\right)$, viz.
[6] $V\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}, q\right)=\sum_{l m} \sum_{l_{1} l_{2}} V_{l, l^{\prime}}^{\left(l_{12} l_{2}\right)}(q)^{*} T^{\left(l_{1,2} l_{2}\right)}\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}\right)$ where $q$ denotes the totality of variables other than $\omega_{1}$ and $\omega_{2}$ on which the potential may depend. Consider two particles which, in the absence of anisotropic interaction [6], are in the degenerate angular momentum manifold
[7] $\quad F_{1} \otimes F_{2}=\operatorname{Span}\left\{\left|F_{1} M_{1}\right\rangle\left|F_{2} M_{2}\right\rangle\right\}$
The effect of [6] on the states [7] to second order is given by the eigenvalues of an effective operator (5) which contains operator products of the form
[8] $\hat{O}(1,2)=P_{F_{1}} P_{F_{2}} T{ }_{Q q}{ }_{Q q}^{\left(Q_{2}\right)}\left(\omega_{1}, \omega_{2}\right)$

$$
\left.\times P_{J_{1}} P_{J_{2}} T_{\left.\frac{Q_{2}^{\prime}}{Q^{\prime}} q^{2} Q^{\prime}\right)}^{\left(\omega_{1}\right.}, \omega_{2}\right) P_{F_{1}} P_{F_{2}}
$$

The operator $\hat{O}(1,2)$ is not a function of $\omega_{1}$ and $\omega_{2}$ in the coordinate representation, and thus cannot be expanded in terms of the bipolar harmonics [5] even within the manifold $F$. Choosing a complete set $\widehat{T}_{l m}^{\left(l_{1} l_{2}\right)}$ of tensor operators in $F$, we can write

$$
[9] \hat{O}(1,2)=\sum_{l m} \sum_{l_{1} l_{2}} \beta_{l m}^{\left(l_{1,}^{\prime} l_{2}\right)} \hat{T}_{l m}^{\left(l_{l m}^{1} l_{2}\right)} C\left(Q Q^{\prime} l ; q q^{\prime} m\right)
$$

where the coefficients $\beta$ are functions of $F_{1}, F_{2}, J_{1}, J_{2}$ as well as of all the $Q^{\prime}$ s. In the present work a closed formula for these coefficients is derived, which involves no summation over the magnetic quantum numbers. For the special case with $F_{i}=1, J_{i}=1$ or 3 , a set of coefficients equivalent to $\beta_{(m)}^{\left(l_{1} l_{2}\right)}$ was tabulated in ref. 4.

## 2. Expressions for the Coefficients $\alpha$ and $\beta$

A complete set of tensor operators in the singleparticle manifold $F$ is defined by
$[10] \quad \hat{C}_{l m}(F)=\sum_{M M}|F M\rangle C\left(F l F ; M^{\prime} m M\right)\left\langle F M^{\prime}\right|$

These are 'unit' operators, in the sense that their reduced matrix elements in the manifold $F$ are equal to unity. It is easy to prove that the tensors [10] transform irreducibly under rotations. As pointed out by Biedenharn and Van Dam (ref. 6, p. 8), the assertion of completeness of such a set of operators is, in essence, the content of the Wigner-Eckart theorem. For even values of $/$ the operators $\hat{C}_{\text {Im }}(F)$ coincide with those given by [1] and [3], whereas for odd $/$ explicit expressions for $\hat{C}_{I m}(F)$ can be constructed out of components of the angular momentum operator $J$, e.g.,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{C}_{1}(F)=P_{F} J P_{F} /[F(F+1)]^{1 / 2} \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

(cf. the operator harmonics of Schwinger, ref. 6, p. 226).

To derive an expression for the coefficients $\alpha_{l m}$ in [4], we invert [4] by using the orthogonality of the Clebsch-Gordan coefficients, and then take matrix elements on both sides of the operator equation, viz.

$$
\begin{equation*}
\alpha_{l m}\langle F M| \hat{C}_{l m}\left|F M^{\prime}\right\rangle=\sum_{n} \sum_{m_{1} m_{2}} C\left(l_{1} l_{2} l ; m_{1} m_{2} m\right)\langle F M| \hat{C}_{l_{1} m_{1}}|J n\rangle\langle J n| \hat{C}_{l_{2} m_{2}}\left|F M^{\prime}\right\rangle \tag{12}
\end{equation*}
$$

Multiplying [12] by $C\left(F / F ; M^{\prime} m M\right)$ and summing over $M, M^{\prime}$, we get

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{2 F+1}{2 l+1} \alpha_{l m}=\sum C\left(F l F ; M^{\prime} m M\right) C\left(l_{1} l_{2} l ; m_{1} m_{2} m\right) C\left(J l_{1} F_{1} ; \mu m_{1} M\right) C\left(F l_{2} J ; M^{\prime} m_{2} \mu\right) \tag{13}
\end{equation*}
$$

where the summation is over all the magnetic numbers but $m$. Contraction of the Clebsch-Gordan coefficient gives, finally,

$$
\alpha_{l m}=(-)^{l} \Pi(l J)\left\{\begin{array}{l}
l_{1} l_{2} l  \tag{14}\\
F F J
\end{array}\right\}
$$

independent of $m$. Here and in what follows we use the notation

$$
\begin{equation*}
\Pi(a b \ldots) \equiv[(2 a+1)(2 b+1) \ldots]^{1 / 2} \tag{15}
\end{equation*}
$$

As an example of the application of this formula, we shall evaluate the commutator of two equivalent operators,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[\hat{C}_{l_{1} m_{1}}(F), \hat{C}_{l_{2} m_{2}}(F)\right]=\sum_{l m} 2 \gamma_{1} C\left(l_{1} l_{2} l ; m_{1} m_{2} m\right) \hat{C}_{l m}(F) \tag{16}
\end{equation*}
$$

The coefficients $\gamma_{1}$ in [16] vanish for even values of $l_{1}+l_{2}+l$ and are given by

$$
\gamma_{t}=(-)^{l} \Pi(l F)\left\{\begin{array}{l}
l_{1} l_{2} l  \tag{17}\\
F F F
\end{array}\right\}
$$

for odd $I_{1}+I_{2}+l$. This result agrees with that derived by Nakamura (7) for the special case $F=1$.
Next, we derive an expression for the $\beta$-coefficients, eq. [9]. As a complete set of two-body operators in the manifold $F_{1} \otimes F_{2}$ we take the following tensors

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{T}_{l m}^{\left(l_{1} l_{2}\right)}=\sum \hat{C}_{l_{1} m_{1}}\left(F_{1}\right) \hat{C}_{l_{2} m_{2}}\left(F_{2}\right) C\left(l_{1} l_{2} l ; m_{1} m_{2} m\right) \tag{18}
\end{equation*}
$$

The reduced matrix elements of these operators are given in terms of a single $9 j$ symbol (ref. 1, p. 152).

The operator $\bar{O}(1,2)$ in [8] can be rewritten in the form
[19] $\Delta^{-1} \widehat{O}(1,2)=\sum \hat{C}_{Q_{1} q_{1}}\left(F_{1}, J_{1}\right) \hat{C}_{Q_{1} \prime_{1}^{\prime} \prime^{\prime}}\left(J_{1}, F_{1}\right) \hat{C}_{Q_{2} q_{2}}\left(F_{2}, J_{2}\right) \hat{C}_{Q_{2^{\prime} q_{2}^{\prime}}\left(J_{2}, F_{2}\right) C\left(Q_{1} Q_{2} Q ; q_{1} q_{2} q\right)}$

$$
\times C\left(Q_{1}^{\prime} Q_{2}^{\prime} Q^{\prime} ; q_{1}^{\prime} q_{2}^{\prime} q^{\prime}\right)
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
\Delta=C\left(J_{1} Q_{1} F_{1} ; 00\right) C\left(J_{2} Q_{2} F_{2} ; 00\right) C\left(F_{1} Q_{1}{ }^{\prime} J_{1} ; 00\right) C\left(F_{2} Q_{2}{ }^{\prime} J_{2} ; 00\right) \tag{20}
\end{equation*}
$$

is the factor containing the product of the reduced matrix elements of the spherical harmonics $C_{l m}(\omega)$. Evaluating the one-body operator products with the help of [4] and [14], and using [18] we get

$$
\begin{align*}
& \Delta^{-1} \hat{O}(1,2)=\sum_{l m} \sum_{l_{1} l_{2}} \hat{T}_{l m}^{\left(l_{l} l_{2}\right)}\left\{\begin{array}{l}
Q_{1} Q_{1}{ }^{\prime} l_{1} \\
F_{1} F_{1} J_{1}
\end{array}\right\}\left\{\begin{array}{l}
Q_{2} Q_{2}{ }^{\prime} l_{2} \\
F_{2} F_{2} J_{2}
\end{array}\right\} \Pi\left(l_{1} I_{2} J_{1} J_{2}\right)(-)^{l_{1}+l_{2}}  \tag{21}\\
& \times \sum C\left(l_{1} l_{2} l ; m_{1} m_{2} m\right) C\left(Q_{1} Q_{1} I_{1} ; q_{1} q_{1}{ }^{\prime} m_{1}\right) C\left(Q_{2} Q_{2}{ }^{\prime} l_{2} ; q_{2} q_{2}{ }^{\prime} m_{2}\right) C\left(Q_{1} Q_{2} Q ; q_{1} q_{2} q\right) C\left(Q_{1}{ }^{\prime} Q_{2}{ }^{\prime} Q^{\prime} ; q_{1}{ }^{\prime} q_{2}{ }^{\prime} q^{\prime}\right)
\end{align*}
$$

In the bottom line of [21] the summation extends over all the magnetic quantum numbers, except $q, q^{\prime}$, and $m$. The sum contracts to

$$
\Pi\left(I_{1} l_{2} Q Q^{\prime}\right)\left\{\begin{array}{l}
Q Q^{\prime} l  \tag{22}\\
Q_{1} Q_{1}^{\prime} l_{1} \\
Q_{2} Q_{2}^{\prime} l_{2}
\end{array}\right\} C\left(Q Q^{\prime} l ; q q^{\prime} m\right)
$$

whence we find that the $\beta$-coefficients are also independent of $m$ and are given by

$$
\Delta^{-1} \beta_{l m}=(-)^{I_{1}+I_{2}}\left(2 l_{1}+1\right)\left(2 l_{2}+1\right) \Pi\left(J_{1} J_{2} Q Q^{\prime}\right)\left\{\begin{array}{l}
Q_{1} Q_{1}^{\prime} l_{1}  \tag{23}\\
F_{1} F_{1} J_{1}
\end{array}\right\}\left\{\begin{array}{l}
Q_{2} Q_{2}^{\prime} l_{2} \\
F_{2} F_{2} J_{2}
\end{array}\right\}\left\{\begin{array}{l}
Q Q^{\prime} l \\
Q_{1} Q_{1}^{\prime} l_{1} \\
Q_{2} Q_{2}^{\prime} l_{2}
\end{array}\right\}
$$

A number of examples of the use of this formula are given in an accompanying paper (8).

1. D. M. Brink and G. R. Satchler. Angular momentum. 2nd ed. (reprinted 1971 with corrections). Clarendon Press, Oxford, England. 1968.
2. K. W. H. Stevens. Proc. Phys. Soc. London, Sect. A. 65. 209 (1952).
3. A. B. Harris. Phys. Rev. B, 2, 3495 (1970).
4. A. B. Harris, A. J. Berlinsky, and W. N. Hardy. Can. J. Phys. 55, 1180 (1977).
5. M. H. L. Pryce. Proc. Phys. Soc. London, Sect. A. 63,25 (1950).
6. L. C. Biedenharn and H. Van Dam. Quantum theory of angular momentum, a collection of reprints and original papers. Academic Press, New York, NY. 1965.
7. T. Nakamura. Progr. Theor. Phys., Suppl. 46, 343 (1970).
8. S. Luryi and J. Van Kranendonk. Cam. J. Phys. This issue.

[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Supported by a grant from the National Research Council of Canada.

